

CLOSED, TYPE-I

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:09-cv-01457-BJR**

BELTRANENA v. CLINTON
Assigned to: Judge Barbara Jacobs Rothstein
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 08/03/2009
Date Terminated: 10/21/2011
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

**FERNANDO LINARES
BELTRANENA**

represented by **W. Asa Hutchinson**
The Asa Hutchinson Law Group PLC
3300 Market Street
Suite 404
Rogers, AR 72758
(479) 878-1600
Email: asa@ahlawgroup.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William A. Hutchinson , III
ATLANTIC LAW GROUP, LLC
803 Sycolin Road
Suite 301
Leesburg, VA 20175
(479) 878-1600
Fax: (479) 878-1605
Email: ahutchinson@ahlawgroup.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON
*In her official capacity as the Secretary of
State for the United States of America*

represented by **Mitchell P. Zeff**
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
555 Fourth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-7352
Fax: (202) 514-8780
Email: mitchell.zeff@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robin Michelle Meriweather
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
555 Fourth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-7198
Fax: (202) 514-8780
Email: robin.meriweather2@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 11/05/2009

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/03/2009	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Filing fee \$ 350, receipt number 4616022884) filed by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(td,) (Entered: 08/04/2009)

08/03/2009		SUMMONS (3) Issued as to HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General (td,) (Entered: 08/04/2009)
09/02/2009	<u>2</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name– William Asa Hutchinson III, :Firm– The Asa Hutchinson Law Group, PLC, :Address– 3300 Market Street, Suite 404, Rogers, Arkansas 72758. Phone No. – 479–878–1600. Fax No. – 479–878–1605 by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Affidavit of William Asa Hutchinson III, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Hutchinson, W.) (Entered: 09/02/2009)
09/08/2009	<u>3</u>	ORDER granting <u>2</u> Motion for Asa Hutchinson to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on 9/8/2009. (zmm,) (Entered: 09/08/2009)
09/16/2009	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Robin Michelle Meriweather on behalf of HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Meriweather, Robin) (Entered: 09/16/2009)
09/16/2009	<u>5</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re <u>1</u> Complaint by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Meriweather, Robin) (Entered: 09/16/2009)
09/17/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>5</u> defendant's consent motion for extension of time up to and including October 16, 2009 to answer. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on September 17, 2009. (MA) (Entered: 09/17/2009)
09/17/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Answer due by 10/16/2009. (zmm,) (Entered: 09/18/2009)
10/15/2009	<u>6</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re <u>1</u> Complaint by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Meriweather, Robin) (Entered: 10/15/2009)
10/16/2009	<u>7</u>	ORDER granting <u>6</u> Defendant's Motion for Extension of Time to Answer. Ordered that the defendant's answer shall be due on or before 10/30/2009. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on 10/16/2009. (mm) (Entered: 10/16/2009)
10/16/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Answer due by 10/30/2009. (zmm,) (Entered: 10/19/2009)
10/30/2009	<u>8</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint filed by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA.(Meriweather, Robin) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
11/05/2009	<u>9</u>	NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Mitchell P. Zeff on behalf of HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON Substituting for attorney Robin M. Meriweather (Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 11/05/2009)
12/09/2009		MINUTE ORDER: The parties are directed to meet and confer and to file a joint proposal for how to proceed in this case, including proposed deadlines for dispositive motions, oppositions, and replies on or before December 22, 2009. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on December 9, 2009. (MA) (Entered: 12/09/2009)
12/09/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Meet & Confer Statement due by 12/22/2009. (zmm,) (Entered: 12/10/2009)
12/22/2009	<u>10</u>	MEET AND CONFER STATEMENT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 12/22/2009)
12/23/2009		MINUTE ORDER that defendant shall produce to plaintiff a Vaughn Index, along with all non-exempted, responsive documents on or before February 12, 2010; dispositive motions shall be filed on or before February 19, 2010; oppositions shall be filed on or before March 2, 2010; and replies, if any, shall be filed on or before March 11, 2010. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on December 23, 2009. (MA) (Entered: 12/23/2009)
12/23/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Dispositive Motions due by 2/19/2010. Opposition to Dispositive Motions due by 3/2/2010. Reply to Dispositive Motions due by 3/11/2010. Responsive documents due by 2/12/2010 (mpt,) (Entered: 12/23/2009)
01/28/2010	<u>11</u>	MOTION for Protective Order by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 01/28/2010)
02/08/2010	<u>12</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>11</u> MOTION for Protective Order filed by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Text of

		Proposed Order)(Hutchinson, William) (Entered: 02/08/2010)
02/12/2010	<u>13</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Complete Initial Discovery and Dispositive Motions</i> by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 02/12/2010)
02/18/2010		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>13</u> defendant's consent Motion for Extension of Time to complete initial discovery and dispositive motions. Defendant shall produce to plaintiff a Vaughn index, along with all non-exempted, responsive documents on or before February 19, 2010. Dispositive motions shall be filed on or before February 26, 2010; oppositions shall be filed on or before March 9, 2010; and replies, if any, shall be filed on or before March 18, 2010. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on February 18, 2010. (MA) (Entered: 02/18/2010)
02/18/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines: Dispositive Motions due by 2/26/2010. Responses to Dispositive Motions due by 3/9/2010. Replies to Dispositive Motions due by 3/18/2010. Vaughn Index to be produced to plaintiff by 2/19/2010 along with all non-exempted, responsive documents. (zmm,) (Entered: 02/18/2010)
02/26/2010	<u>14</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Margaret Grafeld, # <u>2</u> Exhibit, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 02/26/2010)
03/09/2010	<u>15</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Hutchinson, William) (Entered: 03/09/2010)
03/12/2010	<u>16</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>14</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Letter dated May 8, 2007, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Letter dated September 12, 2007, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Letter dated March 6, 2008, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Letter dated April 2, 2008, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Letter dated April 11, 2008, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Letter dated April 13, 2009, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Letter dated December 8, 2009, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Declaration of Grafeld, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Affidavit of Fernando Beltranena, # <u>10</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Hutchinson, William) (Entered: 03/12/2010)
03/15/2010		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>15</u> plaintiff's unopposed Motion for Extension of Time up to and including March 12, 2010 to file oppositions to dispositive motions; replies to oppositions to dispositive motions shall be filed on or before March 23, 2010. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on March 15, 2010. (MA) (Entered: 03/15/2010)
03/15/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines: Replies to Dispositive Motions due by 3/23/2010. (zmm,) (Entered: 03/16/2010)
03/23/2010	<u>17</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Reply Brief and Motion for Leave to File Supplemental Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 03/23/2010)
03/24/2010		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>17</u> defendant's motion for extension of time to file reply brief and motion for leave to file supplemental motion for summary judgment. Defendant's supplemental motion for summary judgment is due on or before April 2, 2010; plaintiff's opposition to defendant's supplemental motion for summary judgment is due on or before April 13, 2010; defendant's reply to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment is due on or before April 22, 2010. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on March 24, 2010. (MA) (Entered: 03/24/2010)
03/24/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines: Supplemental Motion for Summary Judgment due by 4/2/2010. Response due by 4/13/2010. Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 4/22/2010. (zmm,) (Entered: 03/25/2010)
03/26/2010	<u>18</u>	REPLY to Plaintiff's Response in Opposition to <u>14</u> Defendant's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment filed by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON. (Zeff, Mitchell) Modified to add linkage on 3/29/2010 (ztd,). (Entered: 03/26/2010)

04/02/2010	<u>19</u>	Supplemental MOTION for Summary Judgment by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 04/02/2010)
04/13/2010	<u>20</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>19</u> Supplemental MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Hutchinson, William) (Entered: 04/13/2010)
04/22/2010	<u>21</u>	REPLY to Plaintiff's Response in Opposition to Defendant's <u>19</u> Supplemental Motion for Summary Judgment filed by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON. (Zeff, Mitchell) Modified on 4/23/2010 (td,). (Entered: 04/22/2010)
03/17/2011	<u>22</u>	ORDER granting <u>11</u> defendant's Motion for Protective Order; denying without prejudice <u>14</u> defendant's Motion for partial Summary Judgment; denying without prejudice <u>19</u> defendant's supplemental Motion for Summary Judgment. Defendant shall supplement its declarations as directed in the opinion issued this same day. The parties shall file a joint proposed schedule for renewed dispositive motions on or before April 4, 2011. All discovery is stayed in this action pending further court order. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on March 17, 2011. (MA) (Entered: 03/17/2011)
03/17/2011	<u>23</u>	OPINION denying without prejudice defendant's motion for partial summary judgment and supplemental motion for summary judgment, and granting defendant's motion for a protective order. An order consistent with this opinion shall issue this same day. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on March 17, 2011. (MA) (Entered: 03/17/2011)
03/17/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint proposed schedule for renewed dispositive motions due by 4/4/2011. (zmm,) (Entered: 03/18/2011)
04/04/2011	<u>24</u>	MEET AND CONFER STATEMENT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Hutchinson, William) (Entered: 04/04/2011)
04/06/2011	<u>25</u>	ORDER: Counsel for the parties shall confer regularly regarding the progress and status of both Defendant's renewed searches for responsive documents and its segregability re-examination, as directed by this Court's March 17, 2011 Order, and based upon such conferences, the parties may mutually agree to submit a subsequent, Joint Scheduling Proposal to the Court no later than 6/3/2011, which Proposal would propose extending the deadlines stated below. Further ordered that all dispositive motions and supporting affidavit(s) shall be filed no later than 6/3/2011, including a revised Vaughn index from the Defendant to the Plaintiff along with any and all non-exempted, responsive documents. Oppositions to dispositive motions shall be filed no later than 6/24/2011. Replies shall be filed no later than 7/8/2011. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on 4/5/2011. (zmm,) (Entered: 04/06/2011)
06/02/2011	<u>26</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 06/02/2011)
06/03/2011		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>26</u> defendant's consent Motion for Extension of Time up to and including June 9, 2011 to file her summary judgment motion. The remaining briefing schedule shall remain intact. Signed by Judge Paul L. Friedman on June 3, 2011. (MA) (Entered: 06/03/2011)
06/03/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines: Summary Judgment motion due by 6/9/2011. (zmm,) (Entered: 06/06/2011)
06/09/2011	<u>27</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Renewed</i>) by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zeff, Mitchell) (Entered: 06/09/2011)
06/23/2011	<u>28</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Renewed</i>) filed by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Letter dated May 8, 2007, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Letter dated September 12, 2007, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Letter dated March 6, 2008, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Letter dated April 2, 2008, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Letter dated April 11, 2008, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Letter dated April 13, 2009, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Letter dated December 8, 2009, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Declaration of Grafeld)(Hutchinson,

		William) (Entered: 06/23/2011)
07/08/2011	<u>29</u>	REPLY <i>Memorandum in Support of</i> <u>27</u> Defendant's Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment filed by HILLARY RODHAM CLINTON. (Zeff, Mitchell) Modified on 7/11/2011 adding linkage (td,). (Entered: 07/08/2011)
09/01/2011	<u>30</u>	Case reassigned by consent to Judge Barbara Jacobs Rothstein. Judge Paul L. Friedman no longer assigned to the case. (gt,) (Entered: 09/01/2011)
10/12/2011	<u>31</u>	MOTION for Hearing by FERNANDO LINARES BELTRANENA (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Hutchinson, William) (Entered: 10/12/2011)
10/21/2011	<u>32</u>	ORDER granting <u>27</u> Defendant's Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment; denying <u>31</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Hearing; dismissing this case with prejudice. Signed on 10/21/11 by Judge Barbara Jacobs Rothstein, U.S. District Court Judge for Western Washington, sitting by designation. (jeb,) (Entered: 10/21/2011)
10/21/2011	<u>33</u>	JUDGMENT in favor of Defendant, U.S. Department of State against Plaintiff, Fernando Linares Beltranena. Signed by Judge Barbara Jacobs Rothstein on 10/21/2011. (tth) (Main Document 33 replaced on 10/24/2011) (dr) (Entered: 10/21/2011)